

## The Existence of Traditional Markets Post-Regional Autonomy in Bukittinggi, West Sumatra

Mutia Kahanna<sup>1</sup>, Hijratur Rahmi<sup>1</sup>, Muntaha Mardhatillah<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Institut Seni Indonesia Padangpanjang, Indonesia

<sup>2</sup>Universitas Teuku Umar, Indonesia

### ABSTRACT

The research reviewed the existence of traditional markets after regional autonomy in the context of modern market development in Bukittinggi. Using qualitative methods, data were collected through observation, direct interviews, and documentation. Market theory and functional structure theory were employed to analyze the data. The results demonstrate the importance of traditional markets for fulfilling the community's needs. The traditional markets in Bukittinggi consist of Pasar Atas, Pasar Aur Kuning, and Pasar Bawah. Marketers undertake various efforts to survive, such as managing their goods, modifying approaches, prioritizing quality and freshness, building good relationships with buyers, and promoting through social media. The government also takes responsibility for maintaining the existence of traditional markets by providing grants for COVID-19-affected sellers, assisting fire victims, reducing sellers' retribution, and revitalizing traditional markets.

**Keywords:** *Regional Autonomy, Existence, Traditional Market*

**Corresponding author**

**Name:** Mutia Kahanna

**Email:** mutiakahanna@isi.padangpanjang.ac.id

## INTRODUCTION

Regional autonomy has given authority to local governments to regulate their own governance. This authority is stated in Law No. 32 of 2004 (Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 32 of 2004 Concerning Regional Government, 2004) concerning Regional Government which was last amended by Law No. 9 of 2015 (Law of the Republic of Indonesia), which states "Regional autonomy is the obligation, right, and authority of autonomous regions to manage and regulate their own government affairs and the interests of the local community in accordance with laws and regulations". This law gives freedom to local governments to manage and regulate their own regional affairs, determine policies and implement financing and accountability.

In the implementation of regional autonomy, local governments need sources of income to increase development and support the implementation of government. These sources of regional income come from Regional Original Income (PAD), namely regional levies, regional taxes, management of separated regional assets and other legitimate regionally owned companies. The collection of PAD is supported by the issuance of Law No.

28 of 2009 concerning Regional Taxes and Regional Levies (PDRD) which provides for strengthening of authority such as expanding the regional tax base and regional levies and adding types of regional taxes, granting discretion in determining tax rates, and increasing the maximum rates for several types of regional taxes.

Bukittinggi City is an autonomous region that utilizes PAD as a support for organizing government and increasing development. The local government revenue that contributes the most to Bukittinggi City's PAD is local taxes and regional levies, this is known from BPS Bukittinggi data in 2021. Seeing this condition, the Bukittinggi City regional government will always strive to increase its original regional income, especially in terms of local levies and taxes to support government and development. Local levies and taxes are PAD sectors that are obtained periodically. Local levies are payments from the people to the government, because there is a return obtained from the payment (Suparmoko, 2001).

This is the reason for the government to maximize revenue from the sector through policies such as revitalizing traditional markets and building modern markets. The policy aims to increase PAD, because these markets are required to pay monthly levies and regional taxes to the Bukittinggi city government. In the context of regional financial management, the principle of tasks and authorities follows the source of regional income (function follows money) is adopted. So, the higher the ability of a region to obtain original regional income, the greater the tasks and authorities given to the autonomous region (Eko, Sutoro and Rozaki, 2005).

Based on data from the Cooperatives, UKM and Trade Service of Bukittinggi City, it is known that until 2021 there were 31 minimarkets, supermarkets, and plazas in Bukittinggi City. The increasingly rapid development of modern markets can be a threat to the existence of traditional markets in Bukittinggi City, which include Pasar Aur Kuning, Atas, Pasar Atas, dan Pasar Bawah. Traditional markets are identical to bargaining activities between sellers and buyers. The construction of several modern markets close to traditional markets can influence the behavior of buyers (consumers) who prefer to shop at modern markets for reasons of practicality, efficiency, and convenience. Modern markets are markets created by the government, cooperatives or private companies, such as Malls, Hypermarkets, Supermarkets, Department Stores, Mini Markets, and Shopping Centers, which are managed in a modern manner, providing services and convenience when shopping through one-handed management, strong capital and equipped with definite price labels (Sudaryono, 2015).

This condition can indirectly shift the existence of traditional markets in Bukittinggi City which have so far been the center of income for lower middle class traders. Therefore, researchers are interested in studying the existence or presence of traditional markets in Bukittinggi City and the efforts made to maintain the existence of these traditional markets.

## **METHOD**

The method used in this research is a descriptive qualitative approach. According to Sugiyono (2007), the descriptive qualitative method is employed to study the condition of an object, where the researcher acts as the key instrument. Data collection techniques

are conducted through a combination of methods, data analysis is deductive in nature, and the results emphasize meaning over generalization. In this study, the researcher describes and explains the existence of traditional markets amid the development of modern markets following regional autonomy in Bukittinggi.

This research was conducted in traditional markets, namely Pasar Atas, Pasar Bawah, and Pasar Aur Kuning, as well as in several modern markets in the city of Bukittinggi. The data was obtained from two sources: primary and secondary. Primary data was collected from traders with relevant knowledge about the challenges faced by traditional markets in Bukittinggi, the Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises, and Trade, as well as the Regional Development Planning, Research, and Innovation Agency of Bukittinggi. Informants were selected using purposive sampling to ensure the information gathered was relevant and supported the research objectives regarding the existence of traditional markets after the establishment of modern markets in the city.

Secondary data was obtained from documentation and archives of relevant government agencies such as the Department of Cooperatives, UKM, and Trade, and the Regional Development Planning, Research, and Innovation Agency of Bukittinggi. The data collection techniques used in this study follow those outlined by Sugiyono (2007), which include observation, interviews, and documentation. This study follows several stages of data analysis: collecting data related to traditional and modern markets, reducing the data by sorting and organizing it to meet the research objectives, presenting the data in narrative form, including brief descriptions, charts, and tables to enhance understanding, and drawing conclusions to address the research problems identified.

## **FINDING AND DISCUSSION**

### **RESEARCH RESULT**

Traditional markets in Bukittinggi consist of Pasar Atas, Pasar Bawah, and Pasar Aur Kuning. These markets are known for the bargaining activities that take place during buying and selling transactions. According to data from the Department of Cooperatives, Trade, and SMEs of Bukittinggi City, the total number of stalls, kiosks, and shops in Pasar Atas, Pasar Bawah, and Pasar Aur Kuning amounts to 8,252 units. Additionally, it is known that the number of street vendors (PKL) operating in these traditional markets is 622 people, which can increase to 1,092 on market days (Wednesdays and Saturdays).

From a sociological perspective, markets are distinguished as either a process (market process) or a place (marketplace). As a process, the market is viewed as a social institution—a social structure that provides a ready-made order for addressing basic human needs, particularly economic needs related to the distribution of goods and services. As a place, the market refers to the physical location where goods and services are brought for sale and where buyers are willing to purchase them. Therefore, a market can be seen as a series of organized social relationships involved in the process of valuable buying and selling activities. A market can be viewed from various perspectives; for instance, it may be considered a structure dense with social networks or filled with conflicts and competition. The market regulates social life, including the economy, automatically (Damsar, 2018).

Traditional markets are managed with simpler and more conventional methods compared to modern markets. The goods sold in traditional markets are generally not much different from those found in modern markets, with a wide variety of products available. However, differences can be seen in terms of quantity—traditional markets usually have smaller stock supplies, depending on the vendor’s capital or consumer demand. In terms of pricing, traditional markets typically do not use fixed price tags, as prices are adjusted based on the expected profit of each seller. This is due to the dynamic nature of market prices; using price tags would be inconvenient for vendors, who would need to constantly update them to reflect market changes. Traditional markets are characterized by direct interactions between sellers and buyers, usually involving a bargaining process.

### **1. Pasar Atas**

Pasar Atas in Bukittinggi is located in a very strategic area, right in the city center and facing the Jam Gadang (Great Clock Tower), a major tourist attraction. Pasar Atas attracts many tourists for shopping, as it offers a wide variety of souvenirs and traditional crafts unique to Bukittinggi. This market, which has long been a center of economic activity for the people of Luhak Agam, has operated as a conventional retail market characterized by the typical bargaining process between buyers and sellers.

Historically, Pasar Atas was established by the Panghulu Nagari (traditional leaders) of Kurai Limo Jorong under the name *Pasa Kurai* on Bukik Kandang Kabau around the year 1885. At that time, traders sold their goods in simple wooden stalls with thatched palm leaf roofs. The market was particularly lively on Wednesdays and Saturdays, from morning until noon. In 1920, the traditional leaders of Kurai renamed the area *Bukik Nan Tinggi* (The High Hill) because it was the highest among 27 hills in the Kurai region. This name later became the origin of the name Bukittinggi. The market was eventually called *Pasar Atas* (Upper Market) because it was located higher than the surrounding markets (Zulqayyim, 2006).

Due to its elevated location, Pasar Atas can be accessed by several stairways, such as *Janjang Ampek Puluah*, *Janjang Minang*, and *Janjang Gudang*. In 1890, the Dutch colonial government expanded the market area by leveling the hill and constructing stalls with circular-shaped roofs. These stalls were known locally as *Loih Galuang*. Around this area, rows of shops were also built using Dutch-style concrete structures. After that, Chinese and Indian traders began coming to Bukittinggi to conduct business. The Chinese were given space on the west side—now known as Chinatown—while the Indian traders were given space in the north, around the current location of the slaughterhouse.

In the early 1970s, the *Loih Galuang* area was destroyed by fire. On that site, the New Order government built a multi-level market complex with hundreds of kiosks where traders could sell various products. Since then, Pasar Atas has also been known as *Pasa Batingkek* (the multi-level market). It was officially inaugurated by President Soeharto in 1974. Since its construction, the market has suffered four major fires—in 1995, 1997, 2010, and 2017. Following the latest fire on October 30, 2017, which destroyed over 1,000 kiosks, the Bukittinggi city government launched a revitalization project. The reconstruction phase began on August 20, 2019, and was completed on December 31, 2019. The project included

a new design with a *green building* concept, resulting in 837 new kiosks and costing approximately IDR 292 billion.

Pasar Atas Bukittinggi was officially inaugurated virtually by Deputy Minister John Wempi Wetipo on behalf of the Minister of Public Works and Housing (PUPR), Basuki Hadimuljono, on June 18, 2020. The new building covers an area of 39,729 square meters and consists of four floors and one basement. The basement level includes parking space for 202 cars and 20 motorcycles. Other facilities at the market include a green open space, public restrooms, accessible restrooms for people with disabilities, a nursing room, a prayer room (*mushala*), and elevators (Dinas Koperasi, UKM dan Perdagangan, Bukittinggi).

In addition to the revitalized building, Pasar Atas still features several shops, kios, and street vendors who sell their goods around the grand structure. Vendors offer a wide range of products, including food, clothing, embroidered and tailored *Ampek Angkek* fabrics, *Pandai Sikek* woven fabrics, *Silungkang* songket, gold and silver crafts, *Kota Gadang* embroidery, toys, and accessories. Vendors selling traditional snacks from Bukittinggi and surrounding areas offer local specialties such as *kerupuk sanjai*, *kerupuk karak kaliang*, *dakak-dakak*, *karupuak taleh*, *jagung tujin*, *bareh randang*, *kalamai*, *arai pinang*, *kripik kentang*, and *karupuak jangek*. These vendors are located beside the newly revitalized Pasar Atas building.

At the back of Pasar Atas, there is an area known as *Pasa Lereng*, where second-hand but high-quality imported clothes, bed covers, shoes, and bags are sold. These are often branded items in excellent condition. This area is highly popular with people from all walks of life, especially the younger generation, who come to hunt for bargains. Sharp buyer instincts and negotiation skills are essential here to find quality items at low prices. Another famous section of Pasar Atas is *Los Lambuang*, where women sell a variety of traditional Luhak Agam foods such as *lapek*, *onde-onde*, *godok batinta*, *cendol*, *katupek*, and *nasi kapau*. The most dominant dish in this area is *nasi kapau*, originally from Nagari Kapau, known for its various side dishes served with *gulai kapau*—a curry made with bamboo shoots, young jackfruit, long beans, and cabbage. This curry is what distinguishes *nasi kapau* from the more commonly known *nasi Padang*.

The area surrounding the Jam Gadang monument is also filled with street vendors (PKL), who sell accessories, souvenirs, children's toys, and local snacks and drinks. Not far from Pasar Atas, there is Bukittinggi's largest mall: Plaza Bukittinggi, commonly referred to as Ramayana Bukittinggi. The mall has three floors. The first floor contains accessory shops, clothing stores, food outlets, electronics stores, and more. The second and third floors house the Ramayana department store. The second floor sells men's clothing and has a children's play area, while the third floor offers women's clothing and includes the Ramayana supermarket. The mall becomes especially crowded during major sales events, particularly leading up to Eid, when shoppers flock there to take advantage of the discounts.

## **2. Pasar Aur Kuning**

Pasar Aur Kuning in Bukittinggi was established in 1981. At that time, the market consisted of small kiosks, simple stalls, and basic trading areas. To optimize its operations, a terminal was constructed nearby to facilitate transportation between the market and the

terminal, thereby attracting more visitors. The Simpang Aur Kuning Terminal was built in 1982 and began operations in 1983.

The market's growth was further propelled by the construction of shops to accommodate traders relocating from Pasar Atas. This relocation was due to the overcrowding at Pasar Atas, which was densely packed with vendors selling Minangkabau handicrafts and agricultural products. Only textile merchants were moved to Pasar Aur Kuning, leading to its current identity as a wholesale center for textiles and garments.

Strategically located in the heart of Bukittinggi, Pasar Aur Kuning benefits from easy access to transportation, being close to intercity and interprovincial terminals. This accessibility is advantageous for both buyers and sellers.

Today, Pasar Aur Kuning is synonymous with wholesale and garment markets, offering a wide range of products including Muslim attire, fabrics, casual clothing, prayer garments, carpets, bed linens, and curtains. In addition to textiles, the market houses stalls selling vegetables, snacks, fish, meat, fruits, various crackers, and household goods.

### **3. Pasar Bawah**

Pasar Bawah was developed several years after the rapid expansion of Pasar Atas. At that time, the financial resources of Pasarfonds, the managing body of Pasar Atas, were insufficient, prompting the Dutch East Indies government to seek loans from the private sector. According to Zulqayyim (2006), the origins of Bukittinggi's market trace back to a nagari market known as Pakan Kurai, held weekly on Saturdays.

The Dutch East Indies government asserted full rights to develop Pasar Bukittinggi after claiming sovereignty over the area in 1888. In 1890, a loods (market hall) was constructed in the center of the market, becoming its main structure. This building, known as Loih Galuang, featured a semi-circular roof supported by curved iron beams. However, as the number of traders and visitors increased, the capacity of this loods became inadequate.

During the administration of Controleur Westenenk, significant expansions were made to Pasar Bukittinggi. The market area was enlarged by leveling the surrounding land, including the eastern hillside. Irregularly placed stalls were demolished to make way for organized structures. In 1900, a specialized loods for selling meat, known as Loih Dagiang, was built. This facility also accommodated fish vendors, both freshwater and marine.

Loih Dagiang was situated on the eastern slope of Bukik nan Tatinggi, which had been leveled beforehand. Its location allowed waste and wastewater to flow directly into the drainage system at the foot of the hill, maintaining cleanliness. A total of six loods were constructed, scattered across the area. Three were adjacent to the main market loods, one was built northeast of Loih Galuang for dried fish vendors (known as Loih Maco), and two more were established at the northeastern base of Bukik Kubangan Kabau. These latter two, positioned at a lower elevation, became known as Pasar Bawah, designated for traders of coconuts, rice, fruits, and vegetables.

Over time, Pasar Bawah expanded with the addition of Pasar Aua Tajungkang and Pasar Banto. Today, located below the Janjang Ampek Puluah, Pasar Bawah predominantly hosts vendors selling daily food items such as rice, meat, fish, coconuts, vegetables, and

fruits. This aligns with Bukittinggi's hilly geography, which is conducive to producing various vegetables and fruits.

According to Alexander (Malik, 2010), markets are conceptualized as economic institutions that facilitate social interactions. They serve not only as venues for buying and selling goods and services but also as social systems involving retailers, wholesalers, and intermediaries, interconnected through institutionalized practices that are both economic and social in nature. Similarly, traditional markets in Bukittinggi function as both economic and social institutions, where bargaining between traders and buyers occurs. These markets reflect social relationships and values among participants, influenced by the prevailing socio-cultural context.

Therefore, the existence of traditional markets in Bukittinggi represents not only economic realities but also social phenomena, indicating interactive processes among individuals and the formation of personal relationships imbued with values, such as emotional bonds between traders and buyers.

## DISCUSSION

The existence of traditional markets in Bukittinggi City is crucial for meeting the needs of the community. These markets also serve as one of the driving forces behind the dynamics of economic life and act as a central source of income, particularly for traders from the lower-middle class. Bukittinggi is one of the largest wholesale centers on the island of Sumatra due to the presence of the Aur Kuning traditional market, which functions as a wholesale market. This situation certainly benefits Bukittinggi City itself, as it can increase its local revenue (PAD).

Globalization and technological advancement have affected the existence of traditional markets in Bukittinggi due to the growing prevalence of modern markets. The presence of modern markets inevitably impacts the sustainability of trade in Bukittinggi's traditional markets. However, traditional traders in the city have developed several strategies to remain resilient amid the rise of modern markets.

The efforts made by traditional market traders in Bukittinggi include: **First**, arranging their merchandise in an appealing manner to attract customers. This arrangement also aims to make it easier for buyers to choose the items they want to purchase. For example, Zizi (38 years old), a trader at Pasar Atas who sells various songket (woven fabrics), embroidered, and lace fabrics, organizes her merchandise attractively to draw the attention of passersby. Starting from this visual appeal, some customers eventually decide to make a purchase.

**Second**, modifying their merchandise by adding new product variants. Based on an interview with Erna (40 years old), a trader at Pasar Atas, she initially sold prayer garments (mukena), hijabs, tablecloths, embroidered, and lace fabrics. However, as her sales sometimes failed to meet expectations, she began to diversify her products by selling snacks such as *kerupuk sanjai*, *karak kaliang*, pork rinds, and potato chips. This diversification led to an increase in her sales.

**Third**, maintaining the quality of goods. Traders strive to ensure the quality of their merchandise to retain customer trust and prevent disappointment. As stated by Yanti (41 years old), a women's clothing and hijab seller at Aur Kuning Market, she consistently maintains the quality of her products to ensure customers remain loyal. When the cost price increases, Yanti prefers to raise her selling price while maintaining quality rather than reducing product quality. She usually explains this honestly to customers.

**Fourth**, ensuring the freshness of goods, especially food items such as meat, fish, vegetables, fruits, and eggs. Traditional markets typically offer fresher goods compared to supermarkets, as they do not use preservatives. This is evident from the researcher's field observation at Pasar Bawah, where the vegetables sold were indeed fresh.

**Fifth**, building good relationships with customers. Traders provide excellent service by being friendly, polite, and cheerful. This fosters a close relationship between traders and buyers. They often exchange phone numbers to communicate about new stock. Traders also frequently offer special prices to regular customers. For instance, Pak Datuak (45 years old), a textile trader at Aur Kuning Market, often gives discounts to retain loyal customers.

**Sixth**, promoting their merchandise on social media. In addition to selling at traditional markets, some traders also use platforms like WhatsApp, Facebook, and Instagram to promote their products. Hasbi (29 years old), a trader at Pasar Atas who sells various men's Muslim clothing, uses social media to reach a broader customer base. He has even received orders from outside West Sumatra, reaching other regions in Indonesia.

In addition to the efforts made by traders, support from both the central and local governments is also necessary to sustain traditional markets in Bukittinggi. Government initiatives include: **First**, the central government provided financial assistance to Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) in Bukittinggi affected by the COVID-19 pandemic. According to Herman, S.Sos, Head of the Department of Cooperatives, MSMEs, and Trade of Bukittinggi City, Productive Assistance for Micro Enterprises (BPUM) or Direct Cash Assistance (BLT) for MSMEs began in April 2020. In the previous year, the aid amounted to IDR 2,400,000. In 2021, the government resumed the program for 12.8 million recipients, each receiving IDR 1,200,000.

In response to the fire at Pasar Bawah on Saturday, September 11, 2021, which destroyed 300 stalls and caused losses estimated at IDR 2 billion, the Ministry of Cooperatives and SMEs provided aid. Quoted from the official website, Deputy for Micro Enterprises (Eddy Satriya) distributed government assistance of IDR 2,000,000 to 125 affected micro-entrepreneurs to help them restart their businesses.

**Second**, the Bukittinggi city government implemented a policy to reduce market retribution fees. This policy is outlined in Mayor Regulation Number 13 of 2020 concerning Procedures for Reduction, Relief, and Exemption of Wholesale Market and/or Shopping Center Retribution. This initiative aims to reduce the financial burden on traders by offering a 20–30% reduction in retribution fees.

**Third**, revitalizing traditional markets in Bukittinggi. This has been done for Pasar Atas following the fire on October 30, 2017. The reconstruction began on August 20, 2019, and was completed on December 31, 2019. The fire destroyed over 1,000 stalls. The project

introduced a new design based on the green building concept, creating 837 new stalls with a budget of IDR 292 billion. The building occupies 39,729 square meters, featuring four floors and one basement. The basement includes parking for 202 cars and 20 motorcycles. Other facilities include green open spaces, public toilets (including facilities for persons with disabilities), a nursing room, a prayer room (mushalla), and elevators (Department of Cooperatives, MSMEs, and Trade of Bukittinggi City).

The efforts made by traditional market traders and the government to preserve the existence of traditional markets in Bukittinggi can be analyzed using Talcott Parsons' Structural Functional Theory. A market, as a social system, must maintain its existence to continue functioning within society. These preservation efforts can be understood through the AGIL concept (Adaptation, Goal, Integration, and Latency) developed by Parsons, (Ritzer, 2014).

**First, *Adaptation*** means traditional markets must adjust to their environment and needs. This is evident in the traders' use of digital platforms and social media to promote their goods and expand their market reach. **Second, *Goal Attainment*** refers to how traditional markets define their main objectives and the means to achieve them. This is reflected in the traders' efforts to attract customers through proper product arrangement, merchandise diversification, and maintaining quality. **Third, *Integration*** highlights the mutual influence among components of traditional markets to ensure optimal function. This is seen in how the traders' initiatives are supported by government programs, such as financial aid, retribution fee reductions, and market revitalization. **Fourth, *Latency*** (pattern maintenance) involves preserving specific patterns and cultural values through relationships with customers. This is reflected in how traders maintain close, respectful, and warm interactions with buyers and offer special prices to loyal customers.

## CONCLUSION

Traditional markets are characterized by simpler management structures compared to modern markets and are distinguished by direct transactions involving bargaining between buyers and sellers. In the city of Bukittinggi, traditional markets include Pasar Ateh, Pasar Aur Kuning, and Pasar Bawah. Each of these markets possesses unique characteristics in terms of the goods they offer: Pasar Ateh is renowned for selling local Bukittinggi souvenirs, Pasar Aur Kuning serves as a wholesale center for garments and textiles, while Pasar Bawah specializes in daily food commodities.

To sustain the existence of traditional markets in Bukittinggi, traders have undertaken several strategies, including organizing and modifying their merchandise, maintaining the quality and freshness of food products, fostering good relationships with customers, and promoting their products through social media platforms. These efforts are further supported by government initiatives, such as providing financial assistance to micro, small, and medium enterprises (MSMEs) affected by the COVID-19 pandemic and fire disasters, reducing market levies for traders, and carrying out revitalization programs for traditional markets.

## REFERENCES

- BPS Kota Bukittinggi. (2021). Statistik Daerah Kota Bukittinggi 2021. Bukittinggi: Badan Pusat Statistik Kota Bukittinggi.
- Damsar. (2018). Pengantar Sosiologi Pasar. Jakarta: Prenada Media.
- Eko, Sutoro dan Abdur Rozaki. (2005). *Prakarsa Desentralisasi dan Otonomi Desa*. Yogyakarta: IRE Press
- Malik, Luthfi Muhammad. (2010). *Etos Kerja, Pasar Dan Masjid*. Disertasi. FISIP Program Studi Sosiologi. UI Depok Jakarta.
- Ritzer, George. (2014). *Teori Sosiologi Modern Edisi Ketujuh*. Jakarta: Kencana.
- Sudaryono. (2015). *Pengantar Bisnis Teori Dan Contoh Kasus*. Yogyakarta: Andi Press.
- Sugiyono. (2007). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif dan Kuantitatif R&D*. Jakarta : Alfabeta.
- Suparmoko. (2001). *Keuangan Negara Dalam Teori Dan Praktek*. Yogyakarta : BPFE.
- Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 9 Tahun 2015 mengenai Perubahan Kedua Atas Undang-Undang Nomor 23 Tahun 2014 tentang Pemerintahan Daerah
- Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 32 Tahun 2004 tentang Pemerintahan Daerah
- Undang Undang Nomor 28 Tahun 2009 tentang Pajak Daerah dan Retribusi Daerah (PDRD).
- Zulqayyim. (2006). *Boekittinggi Tempo Doeloe*. Padang: Andalas University Press.